



Driftless Area Land Conservancy

Cardinal- Hickory Creek Transmission Line

Rationale for Opposition

Energy Demand is flat or declining

Wisconsin and the upper Midwest as a whole have an excess of electrical generation capacity. Ellen Nowak, former Chair of Wisconsin's Public Service Commission (PSC) and current member explained: "Right now, there's not a need for a lot [of] new generation of any source in Wisconsin."¹ ATC's own ten-year forecast predicts a less than 1/10 of 1 percent per year load growth for the Southwest Wisconsin region through 2027.

Wisconsin already has one of the most reliable energy grids in the country

In a recent comparison with the states nationwide, U.S. News and World Report ranked Wisconsin's electrical grid as among the most reliable systems in the country.²

Little if any economic benefit for Wisconsinites

- Infrastructure Expansion is expensive and increases rates - Since 1998, eight new high capacity transmission lines have been, or are being built in Wisconsin. All have claimed multiple economic benefits for electrical customers. In 1998 Wisconsin's electrical rates were 13 % below the national average, however, today Wisconsin's rates are 12% above the national average and are among the highest rates in the Upper Midwest.³ This is because more than half of an average customer's electrical bill pays for *debt service on capital expenditure construction and maintenance* on projects like the proposed CHC line.
- Property Value is Lost – Property under or near high capacity transmission lines like CHC permanently loses up to 30% of its value. That loss not only affects the property owner, but it lowers revenues for county and local municipalities as well.
- Private Farmland Continues to be Devalued WI Farm Bureau states in their policy manual that "We oppose proposed high voltage power lines running through private property when avoidable in all of Wisconsin"⁴. Farmland will be bulldozed to accommodate this line with little or no consideration of the landowners' needs and wants.
- Tourism Declines – Iowa County and the Driftless Area have a thriving tourism economy that draws people from around the Midwest and beyond. Public snowmobile, biking and hiking trails, world-class trout fishing streams, camping attractions and the like will be negatively impacted by another industrial scale infrastructure.

¹ Maniwoc-Based Wind Tower Manufacturer Wants To Sell More In Wisconsin. (2017, January 19). Retrieved February 13, 2018, from <http://www.wpr.org/maniwoc-based-wind-tower-manufacturer-wants-sell-more-wisconsin>

² Best States for Energy. (n.d.). Retrieved February 12, 2018, from <https://www.usnews.com/news/best-states/rankings/infrastructure/energy>

³ U.S. Energy Information Administration, 2015 https://www.eia.gov/electricity/data/state/avgprice_annual.xls

⁴ 2017 Wisconsin Farm Bureau Policy . (n.d.). Retrieved February 19, 2018, from https://wfbf.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/12/2017-Policy-Book_web.pdf

- Not a job generator -- The recently built sister-project to CHC, Badger-Coulee, runs from LaCrosse to Middleton. Many of those towers were installed with an S-64 Skycrane helicopter that sets poles three times faster than a ground crew can. These projects are not creating long-term, family-sustaining, local jobs. *Solar is the fastest growing energy sector in the world.* Even if demand increases, we could be growing jobs locally, supporting farmers with additional income from solar energy generation and sustaining families with jobs and energy production that stay in Wisconsin.

Not a “Green Energy” Line

Cardinal-Hickory Creek would be an open access line. As such, it would undoubtedly carry some wind-generated energy. However, it will likely primarily carry fossil fuel generated electricity. The grid is more than large enough to carry all the renewable energy ratepayers can afford to build. The problem is only 8% of the power sold in the Midwest is wind energy and 73% is fossil fuel generation.

Up-grades are needed, Not new infrastructure

Upgrades are necessary but have nothing to do with building a new big line. The lines that are in need of upgrading are the ones defined by the Public Service Commission (PSC) staff's Base with Asset Renewal Alternative (BWARA) model. PSC staff recommended this alternative to CHC listing the following benefits:

- A \$900 thousand re-build cost compared to \$300 million (Wisconsin rate-payer cost) for CHC
- All of the reliability benefits of CHC
- Greater economic benefits estimated in 8 of 11 future modeling scenarios studied by PSC staff
- Likely increases in the amount of renewable energy generated and used in Wisconsin

Non-Transmission Alternatives (NTAs) use 21st century technology to lower costs and CO2 emissions.

Local renewable generation, energy efficiency, energy storage, demand response and distribution system upgrades are the fastest, most efficient and cost effective ways to lower our carbon impact and increase grid reliability at the lowest price to ratepayers. This brief clip demonstrates how other states are using these technologies to reduce both CO2 emissions and costs to consumers. <https://rev.ny.gov/> New York is Building the Energy System of Tomorrow, Today

Huge capital projects like Cardinal-Hickory Creek are paid for by ratepayers like you and me.

The fact of the matter is that ATC will earn 10.2% annual return on a \$500 million to \$1 billion construction project. After we spend the next 40 years paying for this project, it will end up costing ratepayers well over \$2 billion dollars – for something that is not needed. This project is great for ATC shareholders, but is bad for you and me.

ATC will use the powers of eminent domain to condemn Iowa County lands for this project.

If there is no demonstrated public benefit or need, should a private, for-profit company like ATC be permitted to take people's land?

The assumptions made ten or more years ago about electrical demand and need for this line are no longer valid. This isn't the time nor the location for the proposed Cardinal-Hickory Creek Transmission project.